

Evaluation of Collaborative Tourism Management during a Pandemic

Dorthea Renyaan

Department of Public Administration Cenderawasih University, Jayapura, Indonesia

ABSTRAK

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk melakukan evaluasi terhadap pengelolaan pariwisata berbasis kolaborasi selama pandemi. Desain yang digunakan dalam penelitian ini adalah deskriptif kualitatif dengan pendekatan studi kepustakaan. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa kolaborasi dalam manajemen pariwisata di Indonesia selama pandemi merujuk pada tiga tema penelitian yang dominan, yaitu percepatan pemulihan berbasis kolaborasi antar lembaga, kolaborasi pemerintah dan pelaku pariwisata, dan kolaborasi dalam pengembangan desa wisata. Namun, perhatian terhadap pengembangan kapasitas dan organizational learning pada masyarakat desa perlu dieksplorasi lebih jauh. Sehingga hasil penelitian ini memerlukan penelitian lanjutan yang mengulas lebih jauh tentang pengembangan kapasitas dan organizational learning untuk meningkatkan kolaborasi masyarakat desa dalam sektor pariwisata.

ABSTRACT

This study aims to evaluate collaboration-based tourism management during a pandemic. The design used in this study is descriptive qualitative with a literature study approach. The survey results show that collaboration in tourism management in Indonesia during the pandemic refers to three dominant research themes: accelerated recovery based on cooperation between institutions, a partnership between the government and tourism actors, and collaboration in developing tourism villages. However, further study must explore the concern for capacity building and organizational learning in rural communities. So the results of this study require further research that reviews more capacity building and organizational learning to increase village community collaboration in the tourism sector.

ARTICLE HISTORY

Submitted: 02-04-2023

Revised: 11-05-2023

Accepted: 12-05-2023

Published: 16-05-2023

KATA KUNCI

Pariwisata Berkelanjutan, Manajemen Kolaboratif, Desa Wisata, COVID-19, Evaluasi

KEYWORDS

Sustainable Tourism, Collaborative Management, Rural Tourism, COVID-19, Evaluation

INTRODUCTION

National resilience in the economic field rests on the economic life of a country that can maintain economic independence. In this sense, being economically independent is measured by working creativity to grow the economy with active community participation (Marlinah, 2017; Rita & Yunus, 2022; Safaria et al., 2019). This frame allows government and community participation to support economic sustainability and development.

Since the enactment of regional autonomy, each regional government must increase its economic growth with creativity and programs. It includes providing to explore and utilizing the existing potential to supply income. One of the supports for local revenue and regional income is the tourism sector (Marlinah, 2017). Law No. 10 of 2009 defines the tourism industry as a group of businesses interconnected in the supply of goods and services to meet the needs of tourists and tourism organizers.

However, the development of tourism in 2020 is hampered by extraordinary natural events on a global scale (Anggarini, 2021). The impact of the pandemic on the tourism sector is quite significant with the tourism value chain, small and medium companies, and the creative economy declining sharply. This is evidenced by the drastic decline in foreign and domestic tourist visits, cancellations of airline tickets between countries and regions, and hotel cancellations, including the reluctance of people to travel to certain places to avoid exposure to COVID-19. Behind that, the most obvious impacts are MSME businesses, informal workers, and reduced employment (Sugihamretha, 2020).

Many researchers have carried out research on the impact of the pandemic on the tourism sector. One of them was carried out by Kusuma et al. (2021) which showed that there was a large-scale

termination of company relations with employees in tourist areas due to huge losses during the pandemic. In this study, Kusuma (2021) states that the recovery of the tourism sector as a result of a pandemic requires long stages and more persistent efforts than before the pandemic. Then research Purike (2021) looks more specifically at the obstacles faced by hotel companies in marketing techniques that are not yet optimal. In addition, Purike (2021) notes the importance of certain innovations to generate interest in visits and maximize accommodation in hotels in tourist areas. Nugraha (2021) exposes how business units in the tourism area during the pandemic have decreased by up to 70%. These business actors are creative with their respective businesses to improve and manage their business units so they can survive during the pandemic. The most striking thing according to Nugraha (2021) is the decrease in income for business actors depending on the type of business being carried out, especially small food businesses such as coconut bananas. Then research Muttaqin & Harmawan (2021) puts forward the conceptual development of learning tourism policies during a pandemic. However, based on these studies, not many studies with the theme of evaluating tourism management collaboration during a pandemic have been carried out. So this research aims to evaluate collaboration-based tourism management during a pandemic.

Literature Review

Conceptual Framework

According to Moekijat (1995: 180) in Suaib (2016: 107) evaluations are attempts to investigate whether the program implemented is in accordance with what is desired or not. Meanwhile, Bryan & White (1987) in Suaib (2016: 107) defines evaluation as an attempt to document what happened and also why it happened. Ideally, a project is designed to determine that causal relationship, and thus the forethought regarding evaluation is an attempt to find out if the link really exists.

According to Stern (2009), there are 3 types of policy evaluation namely Ex-ante evaluation, Ongoing evaluation, and Ex-post evaluation. Ex-ante evaluation is a policy evaluation that is carried out before the policy is implemented. Hypothetically, this type of evaluation is intended to anticipate and provide an initial assessment of the estimated effects or impacts and consequences of planned or established policies. The aim is to provide information that is relevant to the policy or to the ongoing policy-making process. Ex-ante evaluation is an important instrument for determining the choice of various existing policy options. This type of evaluation also provides an impact analysis on the policy environment. On-going Evaluation identify and measure the impact and outcomes of ongoing programs. Ongoing evaluation is to provide relevant information and return to the policy implementation process, especially at certain stages of policy implementation. Policymakers can use this information to improve, revise, and "straighten" the policy implementation process in the direction it wants to achieve. The last is Ex-post evaluation; Wolman et al. (2004) argue that this evaluation is a classic variant of policy evaluation. This evaluation is intended to provide an assessment of the level of achievement of objectives and the impact of policies that have been implemented. It is also an evaluation of policy outcomes. Based on this understanding, the evaluation used in this study is ongoing; this is to explore the relevance of government policies in the tourism sector during the pandemic so that this research will become a direct recommendation for policymakers in the tourism sector in the future, after or during another pandemic in the future.

Collaborative Management in Tourism Development

Collaborative management in tourism development aims to maintain relationships and cooperation between organizations or agencies (Fairuzah, 2017; Nadjib, 2016; Situngkir et al., 2020). In practice collaborative management requires more than one organization to be

involved. Collaborative relationships between individuals and organizations will certainly be able to solve various tourism development problems that may not be solved or resolved by individuals or organizations and it is possible that other organizations will be able to solve them. In this regard, Johnson et al. (1964) emphasized the importance of understanding the principles of collaboration management. These principles include cross-sector coordination, stakeholder integration, simplification or simplification in management, synchronization, and mechanization that are oriented toward common goals (Muttaqin, 2023; Mustafa, 2020). Thus the management of collaborative-based tourism during the pandemic emphasizes multi-stakeholder cooperation in an effort to achieve common goals.

Collaboration in tourism management is one of the highlights of various research. In addition to an emphasis on collaboration, community capacity building and organizational learning themes in village tourism management need to be of concern to future researchers to support the concept and practice of tourism collaboration.

RESEARCH METHODS

The design used in this study is descriptive qualitative with a literature study approach. Sources of data come from previous research and other literature related to the themes in the research taking

into account the year of publication 2020-2023. Data analysis includes data collection, categorization, presentation, and drawing conclusions. The referenced literature comes from portals such as Google Scholar and Garuda. The keywords used in the literature search include; Policy Evaluation, Tourism Management, and Pandemic. The writer found around 27 articles that fit the theme of this study, and specific examination selected 6 articles that were suitable for literature review material. For this reason, the categorization of data sources used can be seen in the following table.

Table 1.
The Categorization Of Data Sources

Part	Data inclusion	Data exclusion
Research focus	Research that focuses on collaborative management of tourism during a pandemic. In addition, research that specifically discusses the role of tourism organizations is also included.	Research that is not related to tourism management during a pandemic
Context	Field research journals, literature studies, service journals, policy analysis, community social analysis, policy environment, tourism development during the pandemic	Paper briefs, personal opinions, blog articles, and book chapters are not the criteria for review.
Method	Qualitative, quantitative, mixed methods, and literature studies	Technical methods related to community service are not included
Research theme	Studies related to collaborative and tourism	Not use studies related to applied science

Source: Made by the author (2023)

RESEARCH RESULTS

Since the pandemic hit the global economy, all state governments have taken various strategic steps to stem and restore their economic situation (Sumarni, 2020). In Indonesia, the government has taken various steps to overcome this problem, including in the tourism sector. Through the Ministry of tourism, the government implements a policy called Cleanliness, Health, Safety, and Environmental Sustainability (CHSE) aimed at all tourism areas (Kemenparekraf/Barekraf, 2020). The purpose of this policy is to provide guarantees for tourists and tourists regarding health and reduce potential exposure to viruses (Anggarini, 2021).

However, the implementation of this policy is not easy. Without cross-stakeholder collaboration, the CHSE policy is only a product of discourse on the macro policy trajectory (Muttuqin & Harmawan, 2021). For this reason, De Vries et al. (2016) emphasize the importance of innovation and collaboration in an effort to achieve common goals in a policy. Regarding the policy sector, the innovation in this study is linked to the development of collaborative principles. In this mechanism, collaboration forms a series of processes that involve multiple actors within an organization and outside the organization to work together to achieve goals, including developing ideas that lead to innovation and creation in the midst of a pandemic.

In this regard, based on a review of the literature and highlights on the implementation of collaborative-based tourism policies during a pandemic, this study can be described in the following table.

Table 2.
Results of Literature Review

Collaboration	Author and year of publication	Research purposes	Method	Text output
Acceleration of Recovery based on Collaboration between institutions	Mulyani et al. (2022)	Examining strategies to accelerate economic recovery through the development of the halal industry in the tourism sector	Descriptive Qualitative	The scope of development of the halal industry includes human resources, training and development, and collaboration between institutions.
	Arisanti & Suderana (2020)	Analyzing the government's collaboration with the Indonesian Youth National Committee	Descriptive Qualitative	· Mutual aid local wisdom approach through the formation of a youth task force to fight COVID-19
				· Development of prevention of the spread of COVID-19 through information technology
· The Youth Task Force to Fight COVID-19 also helps educate the public to apply health protocol principles, especially people who live in				



Collaboration	Author and year of publication	Research purposes	Method	Text output
Government Collaboration and Tourism Actors	Rita & Yunus (2022)	Examining collaboration between the government and tourism actors specific to the creative economy	Descriptive Qualitative	<p>tourism areas.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> · Government as a facilitator; where the government has the role of facilitating the creative economy with skills training from production to marketing of business results. · Government as regulator; at this point the government is the decision maker for policies designed to provide convenience for creative economy entrepreneurs. · Government as a catalyst; where the government is involved in managing creative economy management institutions, empowerment through the digital economy for MSMEs.
Collaboration in the development of Tourism Villages	Fakhrana (2021)	Reviewing the implementation of tourism promotion programs through the My Tourism Village Activities	Qualitative Case Study Approach	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> · BPPD is planning the purpose of the event, namely to raise tourism potential and promote it · Increasing public insight and awareness about tourism · Providing stimulants and assistance to tourism actors, participating in efforts to reduce the impact of Covid-19 by presenting content that can be accessed on social media and helping to increase economic movement in villages.

Collaboration	Author and year of publication	Research purposes	Method	Text output
	Sari & Sitorus (2021)	Analyze the government's role in supporting collaborative tourism village accommodation	Qualitative	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The government supports tourist village accommodation by involving home stay managers in rural areas, village government, and the private sector. This collaboration is carried out through the development of intensive tourism promotion on social media.
	Putra (2021)	Analysis of collaboration in developing a tourism village business strategy through the pentahelix scheme	Qualitative Descriptive	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Tourism village management in collaboration with the village government and the village community empowerment service The pentahelix model is seen from the university's role in empowering human resources BUMDes, farmer groups, tourism awareness groups, livestock groups, and the Village Community Empowerment Service (DPMD)

Source: Procced by the author (2023)

Based on the results of a literature search on the theme of collaboration in tourism management in Indonesia during the pandemic, shows that there are three dominant research themes discussing the theme of collaboration. The first theme is Accelerated Recovery based on Collaboration between institutions. In this theme, Mulyani et al.'s research is represented. (2022) with the title "Accelerating economic recovery after the Covid-19 Pandemic through the Development of the halal industry sector in Indonesia." In their research, Mulyani et al. (2022) emphasized that halal tourism has a major role in economic recovery during and after the Covid-19 Pandemic. The development of collaboration in this research departs vertically, where the government, private sector, and business actors need to develop policies that make it easier for business actors, especially MSMEs in the tourism sector. In addition, according to Mulyani, strategies that can be implemented to accelerate economic recovery include strengthening the halal value chain, certifying halal products, strengthening halal industry management, carrying out vigorous promotions, increasing MSME sector development, increasing the role of policies, and supervising the development of halal tourism.

Furthermore, research conducted by Arisanti & Suderana (2020) with the research title "Handling the Covid-19 Pandemic: Collaboration of the District Government with the Gianyar KNPI in Gianyar Regency, Bali" which analyzes the government's collaboration with the Indonesian Youth National Committee, shows that there are three scales of collaboration. First, there is a mutual aid local wisdom approach through the formation of a youth task force to fight COVID-19. Second, the development of preventing the spread of COVID-19 through information technology. Third, the Indonesian Youth National Committee, which formed the Youth Task Force to Fight COVID-19, also helps educate the public to apply health protocol principles.

The second theme is collaboration between the government and tourism actors which is represented by research by Rita & Yunus (2022) entitled "Analysis of the Development of Collaboration between Local Governments and Tourism Actors in Creative Economy Recovery in Polewali Mandar Regency." Rita & Yunus analyzes the collaboration between the government and tourism actors specific to the creative economy. The results of his research show that the dominant role of the government is divided into three units. First, the government as a creative economy facilitator with skills training from production to marketing business results. Second, the government as a regulator or decision maker for policies designed to provide convenience for creative economy entrepreneurs. Finally, the government as a catalyst; where the government is involved in managing creative economy management institutions, empowerment through the digital economy for MSMEs.

The third theme is Collaboration in the development of Tourism Villages. Collaborative research is dominant in the development of tourist villages with three studies. Research (Fakhrana, 2021) shows that collaboration between the government through the BPPD is carried out by designing certain events as a means of promotion. In addition, his research points to collaborative efforts aimed at building public awareness about tourism, including developing promotions through digital content, so that people participate in it. then research by Sari & Sitorus (2021) shows that the local government supports village tourism accommodation by involving the village community, and other parties such as lodging businesses and the private sector to carry out tourism promotion. This was also confirmed by Putra (2021) through his research which developed collaborative strategies in tourism promotion. However, from these three studies, Putra's research shows that the pentahelix model needs to be further developed so that tourism villages in the midst of a pandemic still follow the corridors of health protocols, as directed, and government policies.

DISCUSSION

The results of the study show that collaboration in tourism recovery has a positive impact. Vaccination policies and stakeholder support have increased public trust in both tourism managers and tourists. As a result, several tourist sites have recovered, although strict health protocols are still being enforced. Collaboration between the government and tourism managers in efforts to restore the tourism sector, especially tourism, and collaboration between parties are three crucial points. First, the government has indeed made a policy by providing a number of incentives to anticipate sluggish tourism and encourage tourist visits. In addition to the incentives allocated for a number of posts such as incentives for airlines and flight agents, they are also for tourism promotion activities. Second, the government allows the opening of tourist attractions on holidays such as Eid 2021 without careful anticipation, resulting in the phenomenon of an increase in tourist visits to a number of tourist attractions. Many destinations were found to be over capacity, triggering crowds and violations of health protocols. Third, the government paid little heed to the warnings of epidemiologists about the second wave of COVID-19. In particular, it is considered that the government has not maximally involved the role of the community in making decisions regarding the handling of the COVID-19 pandemic which has resulted in compliance with health protocols declining. Stakeholder collaboration is believed to improve the quality of tourism sector management and planning. With this collaboration, the policy framework for the recovery of the tourism sector, especially in the post-COVID-19 pandemic period, will be stronger and will receive support from various stakeholders. Partnerships between stakeholders will determine the speed of the recovery process in the tourism sector. It indicates the widespread issue of maintaining collaborative management on how participation and distribution of responsibilities between actors (Phi & Dredge, 2019).

Minister of Tourism Regulation No. 14 of 2016 concerning Guidelines for Sustainable Tourism Destinations implicitly paved the way for multi-stakeholder collaboration to support the growth of

a connected and integral system known as the Penta Helix concept. In this concept the success of economic development is closely related to the synergistic collaboration of various parties (Indra Jaya, 2022; Pugra et al., 2021; Pusparani & Rianto, 2021; Sudiana et al., 2020; Wahidah & Suherman, 2022). Related to rural tourism, Penta Helix covers academia, government, community, business and media. The collaboration of each of these parties focuses on their roles in the stages of managing tourism during a pandemic, from the preparation stage by identifying potential tourist destinations and monitoring the implementation of the CHSE policy during the pandemic, monitoring and evaluating the development of the implementation of the CHSE policy to ensure prevention of the spread of COVID-19 in tourist sites. McCartney et al. (2022) framed a blueprint for tourism management collaboration in critical times by adding actors from a health background. It affirms that the actors involved in the Penta Helix concept develop dynamically according to certain situations.

The evaluation shows that the capacity of government policies in economic recovery in the tourism sector is experiencing a number of problems. This problem was narrowed down in studies with rural-based sectoral tourism management. These studies indicate the complexity of the problem of village tourism development in terms of community capacity building to contribute to tourism. In their research, Utami et al. (2023) explained that cooperation and collaboration are the keywords for successful village tourism management. Another study by Ismanto et al. (2023) shows that village tourism management requires effective leadership, active community participation, and support. However, market, social and educational risks are inherent factors behind the need for village community participation in tourism management (Liu et al., 2022). In addition to an emphasis on collaboration, community capacity building and organizational learning themes in village tourism management need to be of concern to future researchers to support the concept and practice of tourism collaboration.

CONCLUSION

Based on the results of a literature search with the theme of collaboration in tourism management in Indonesia during the pandemic, it shows that there are three dominant research themes discussing collaboration themes, namely accelerated recovery based on collaboration between institutions, a collaboration between the government and tourism actors, and collaboration in the development of tourism villages. Collaboration in tourism management is one of the highlights of various research. In addition to an emphasis on collaboration, community capacity building and organizational learning themes in village tourism management need to be of concern to future researchers to support the concept and practice of tourism collaboration.

REFERENCES

- Anggarini, D. T. (2021). Upaya Pemulihan Industri Pariwisata Dalam Situasi Pandemi COVID-19. *Jurnal Pariwisata*, 8(1), 22–31. <https://doi.org/10.31294/par.v8i1.9809>
- Arisanti, N. M. D., & Suderana, I. W. (2020). Penanganan Pandemi Covid-19: Kolaborasi Pemerintah Kabupaten Bersama KNPI Gianyar di Kabupaten Gianyar, Bali. *Spirit Publik: Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 15(2), 87–96. <https://doi.org/10.20961/sp.v15i2.43097>
- De Vries, H., Bekkers, V., & Tummers, L. (2016). Innovation in the public sector: A systematic review and future research agenda. *Public Administration*, 94(1), 146–166. <https://doi.org/10.1111/padm.12209>
- Fairuzah, M. (2017). Kolaboratif Antar Stakeholder Dalam Pembangunan Inklusif Pada Sektor Pariwisata. *Jurnal Kebijakan Dan Manajemen Publik*, 5(3), 4–5.
- Fakhrana, D. (2021). Aktivitas Promosi Badan Promosi Pariwisata Daerah Kabupaten Ciamis melalui

- Kegiatan Desaku Wisataku. *Jurnal Riset Manajemen Komunikasi*, 61–68. <https://doi.org/10.29313/jrmk.v1i1.163>
- Indra Jaya, W. (2022). Peluang Kolaborasi Penta Helix bagi Pengembangan Desa Wisata di Provinsi Lampung. *JlIP: Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Pemerintahan*, 7(2), 119–135.
- Ismanto, S. U., Indira, D., & Santoso, M. B. (2023). Community Involvement Based on Community-Based Tourism Principles in the Development of Area-Based Tourism in Cirebon Regency. *Jurnal Manajemen Pelayanan Publik*, 6(2), 84–99. <https://doi.org/10.24198/jmpp.v6i2.45278>
- Johnson, R. A., Kast, F. E., & Rosenzweig, J. E. (1964). Systems theory and management. *Management Science*, 10(2), 367–384. <https://doi.org/10.1287/mnsc.10.2.367>
- Kemenparekraf/Barekraf. (2020). *Pariwisata Indonesia Siap!* Chse.Kemenparekraf.Go.Id. <https://chse.kemenparekraf.go.id/>
- Kusuma, P. A., Mutiarin, D., & Damanik, J. (2021). Strategi pemulihan dampak wabah covid pada sektor pariwisata di daerah istimewa Yogyakarta. *Journal of Tourism and Economic*, 4(1), 47–59. <https://doi.org/10.36594/jtec.v4i1.110>
- Liu, Y., Shi, H., Su, Z., & Kumail, T. (2022). Sustainability and Risks of Rural Household Livelihoods in Ethnic Tourist Villages: Evidence from China. *Sustainability*, 14(9), 5409. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su14095409>
- Marlinah, L. (2017). Meningkatkan ketahanan ekonomi nasional melalui pengembangan ekonomi kreatif. *Cakrawala: Jurnal Humaniora Bina Sarana Informatika*, 17(2), 258–265.
- McCartney, G., Ung, C. O. L., & Pinto, J. F. (2022). Living with COVID-19 and sustaining a tourism recovery—adopting a front-line collaborative response between the tourism industry and community pharmacists. *Tourism and Hospitality*, 3(1), 47–68. <https://doi.org/10.3390/tourhosp3010004>
- Mulyani, S., Ismail, M., & Rofiq, A. (2022). Percepatan pemulihan ekonomi pasca pandemi Covid 19 melalui pengembangan sektor industri halal di Indonesia. *MALIA: Jurnal Ekonomi Islam*, 13(2), 167–180. <https://doi.org/10.35891/ml.v13i2.3157>
- Mustafa, M. (2020). Rancang Bangun Sistem Kolaborasi UKM Berdasarkan Manajemen Rantai Pasok untuk Peningkatan Daya Saing UMKM Kota Semarang. *Walisongo Journal of Information Technology*, 2(2), 93–104. <https://doi.org/10.21580/wjit.2020.2.2.5824>
- Muttaqin, M. Z. (2023). Discourse Interrelation in Public Administration Epistemology: A Review of Recent Two Books. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01900692.2022.2049816>
- Muttaqin, M. Z., & Harmawan, B. N. (2021). West Nusa Tenggara Tourism Policy Learning Responding to the Covid-19 Pandemic. *Jurnal Kepariwisata: Destinasi, Hospitalitas Dan Perjalanan*, 5(2), 83–95. <https://doi.org/10.34013/jk.v5i2.562>
- Nadjib, M. (2016). Problematika prinsip manajemen kolaboratif dalam kerangka penyelamatan DanauRawapening. *Jurnal Masyarakat Dan Budaya*, 18(3), 487–502.
- Nugraha, Y. E. (2021). Dampak Pandemi Covid 19 Pada Unit Usaha Pariwisata di Kawasan Pesisir Kota Kupang. *Jurnal Industri Pariwisata*, 3(2), 134–149. <https://doi.org/10.36441/pariwisata.v3i2.411>
- Phi, G. T., & Dredge, D. (2019). Collaborative tourism-making: An interdisciplinary review of co-creation and a future research agenda. *Tourism Recreation Research*, 44(3), 284–299. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02508281.2019.1640491>

- Pugra, I. W., Oka, I. M. D., & Suparta, I. K. (2021). Kolaborasi Pentahelix Untuk Pengembangan Desa Timpag Menuju Desa Wisata Berbasis Green tourism. *Bhakti Persada Jurnal Aplikasi IPTEKS*, 7(2), 111–120. <https://doi.org/10.31940/bp.v7i2.111-120>
- Purike, E. (2021). Kendala dan dampak pandemi covid-19 pada sektor pariwisata dan perhotelan di Kota Bandung. *Cross-Border*, 4(2), 566–580.
- Pusparani, P., & Rianto, R. (2021). Implementasi Konsep Pentahelix Dalam Pengembangan Desa Wisata Cibuntu. *Sadar Wisata: Jurnal Pariwisata*, 4(1), 21–27. <https://doi.org/10.32528/sw.v4i1.5389>
- Putra, I. K. (2021). Akselerasi Pertumbuhan Bisnis di Sektor Pariwisata di Era Pandemi Covid 19 Melalui Pendekatan Pentahelix. *Sketsa Bisnis*, 8(1), 34–46. <https://doi.org/10.35891/jsb.v8i1.2580>
- Rita, R., & Yunus, M. Y. (2022). Analisis Pengembangan Kolaborasi Antara Pemerintah Daerah Dan Pelaku Pariwisata Dalam Pemulihan Ekonomi Kreatif Di Kabupaten Polewali Mandar. *SEIKO: Journal of Management & Business*, 5(2), 390–402.
- Safaria, A. F., Widianingsih, I., Muhtar, E. A., & Irawati, I. (2019). Model Inovasi Kolaboratif dalam Implementasi Program Open Data: Tantangan dan Manfaatnya bagi Publik. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik (Public Administration Journal)*, 9(1), 9–20. <https://doi.org/10.31289/jap.v9i1.2150>
- Sari, L., & Sitorus, N. I. B. S. (2021). Kolaborasi Stakeholder Pariwisata dalam Pengelolaan Akomodasi di Desa Wisata Kabupaten Purwakarta di Masa Pandemi Covid-19. *Jurnal Indonesia Sosial Sains*, 2(09), 1489–1496. <https://doi.org/10.36418/jiss.v2i9.403>
- Sholeh, C., Sintaningrum, S., & Sugandi, Y. S. (2019). Formulation of innovation policy: Case of Bandung smart city. *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Ilmu Politik*, 22(3), 173. <https://doi.org/10.22146/jsp.33698>
- Situngkir, B., Lubis, Z., & Kadir, A. (2020). Peluang Pelaksanaan Manajemen Kolaboratif dalam Pengembangan Kawasan Situs Kota Cina sebagai Potensi Pariwisata di Kota Medan. *PERSPEKTIF*, 9(2), 149–167. <https://doi.org/10.31289/perspektif.v9i2.3295>
- Stern, E. (2009). Evaluation policy in the European Union and its institutions. *New Directions for Evaluation*, 2009(123), 67–85. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ev.306>
- Sudiana, K., Sule, E. T., Soemaryani, I., & Yunizar, Y. (2020). The development and validation of the penta helix construct. *Business: Theory and Practice*, 21(1), 136–145. <https://doi.org/10.3846/btp.2020.11231>
- Sugihamretha, I. D. G. (2020). Respon kebijakan: Mitigasi dampak wabah Covid-19 pada sektor pariwisata. *Jurnal Perencanaan Pembangunan: The Indonesian Journal of Development Planning*, 4(2), 191–206. <https://doi.org/10.36574/jpp.v4i2.113>
- Sumarni, Y. (2020). Pandemi Covid-19: Tantangan ekonomi dan bisnis. *Al-Intaj: Jurnal Ekonomi Dan Perbankan Syariah*, 6(2), 46–58. <https://doi.org/10.29300/aij.v6i2.3358>
- Sugandi, Y. S. (2016). Program Penanggulangan Kemiskinan Perkotaan: Pengalaman Kota Bandung. *JAKPP (Jurnal Analisis Kebijakan & Pelayanan Publik)*, 109-128.
- Syafrini, D., Fadhil Nurdin, M., Sugandi, Y. S., & Miko, A. (2020). The impact of multiethnic cultural tourism in an Indonesian former mining city. *Tourism Recreation Research*, 45(4), 511-525.
- Utami, D. D., Dhewanto, W., & Lestari, Y. D. (2023). Rural tourism entrepreneurship success factors for sustainable tourism village: Evidence from Indonesia. *Cogent Business & Management*, 10(1), 2180845. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311975.2023.2180845>
- Wahidah, I., & Suherman, D. (2022). Penta Helix Collaboration in Increasing Regional Tourism Competitiveness of Bandung City. *Jurnal Manajemen Pelayanan Publik*, 6(1), 14-29. <https://doi.org/10.24198/jmpp.v6i1.39986>



Wolman, H., Hill, E. W., & Furdell, K. (2004). Evaluating the success of urban success stories: Is reputation a guide to best practice? *Housing Policy Debate*, 15(4), 965–997. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10511482.2004.9521528>